



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

Public Availability of Inoperative Agency Guidance Documents

Committee on Regulation

Proposed Recommendation | December 16, 2021

Proposed Amendments

This document displays manager's amendments (with no marginal notes) and additional amendments from a Conference member (with source shown in the margin).

1 Agencies issue guidance documents to help explain their programs and policies,
2 announce their interpretation of laws, and communicate other important information to regulated
3 entities, regulatory beneficiaries, and the broader public.¹ The Administrative Conference has
4 issued several recent recommendations regarding guidance documents.² Among them was
5 Recommendation 2019-3, *Public Availability of Agency Guidance Documents*, which encourages
6 agencies to facilitate public access to guidance documents on their websites.

7 Over time, a given guidance document may no longer reflect an agency's position. An
8 agency may rescind the document in whole or in part by announcing that it no longer reflects the
9 agency's position. Even without being rescinded in whole or in part, a guidance document may
10 be superseded in whole or in part by later statutory, regulatory, or judicial developments, or it

¹ Guidance documents include what the Administrative Procedure Act calls "interpretive rules" and "general statements of policy." 5 U.S.C. § 553(b). They may also include other materials considered to be guidance documents under other, separate definitions adopted by government agencies. *See* Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2019-3, *Public Availability of Agency Guidance Documents*, 84 Fed. Reg. 38931, 38931 (Aug. 8, 2019).

² *See, e.g.*, Recommendation 2019-3, *supra* note 1; Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2019-1, *Agency Guidance Through Interpretive Rules*, 84 Fed. Reg. 38927 (Aug. 8, 2019); Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2017-5, *Agency Guidance Through Policy Statements*, 82 Fed. Reg. 61734 (Dec. 29, 2017); Admin. Conf. of the U.S., Recommendation 2014-3, *Guidance in the Rulemaking Process*, 79 Fed. Reg. 35992 (June 25, 2014).



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

11 may fall into disuse in whole or in part. The present Recommendation terms these documents
12 “inoperative guidance documents.”

13 Some inoperative guidance documents will be of interest to the public because they
14 disclose how an agency’s legal interpretations have changed³ or how policies or programs have
15 changed over time.⁴ But if these documents are not posted on an agency’s website, they will be
16 either inaccessible (except through a Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request), in the case of
17 documents not published in the *Federal Register*, or not as accessible as they should be, in the
18 case of documents that were noticed in the *Federal Register*.⁵

19 Three statutes require agencies to make some inoperative guidance documents publicly
20 available. The Federal Records Act requires agencies to post on their websites materials that are
21 of “general interest or use to the public.”⁶ FOIA requires agencies to publish notices in the
22 *Federal Register* when they have rescinded or partially rescinded guidance documents that are
23 addressed to the public generally rather than to specific individuals or organizations.⁷ The E-
24 Government Act requires agencies to publish these rescission and partial rescission notices on
25 their websites.⁸ Many agencies have also issued regulations pertaining to the public availability
26 of their inoperative guidance documents.

27 The Office of Management and Budget’s 2007 *Final Bulletin for Agency Good Guidance*
28 *Practices* imposes additional requirements on agencies relating to inoperative guidance
29 documents. It directs all agencies other than independent regulatory agencies to post notices on

³ See Blake Emerson & Ronald Levin, Agency Guidance Through Interpretive Rules: Research and Analysis (May 28, 2019) (report to the Admin. Conf. of the U.S.).

⁴ See Nicholas R. Parrillo, Agency Guidance Through Policy Statements: An Institutional Perspective (Oct. 12, 2017) (report to the Admin. Conf. of the U.S.).

⁵ See Recommendation 2019-3, *supra* note 1.

⁶ See 44 U.S.C. § 3102(2).

⁷ See 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(1); Nat’l Org. of Veterans’ Advocs., Inc. v. Sec’y of Veterans Affairs, 981 F.3d 1360, 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2020).

⁸ See E-Government Act of 2002, Pub. L. No. 107-347, § 206, 116 Stat. 2899, 2916 (codified at 44 U.S.C. § 3501 note).



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

30 their websites whenever they have rescinded or partially rescinded significant guidance
31 documents and to keep those notices in place for a year. It also encourages agencies to stamp or
32 otherwise prominently identify as “superseded” those significant guidance documents that have
33 become inoperative but which remain available for historical purposes.⁹

34 Recommendation 2019-3, though concerned primarily with operative guidance
35 documents, makes several recommendations relating to the posting of inoperative guidance
36 documents. In summary, it recommends that agencies (1) mark posted guidance documents to
37 indicate whether they are current or were withdrawn or rescinded and (2) in the case of rescinded
38 or withdrawn documents, note their rescission or withdrawal date and provide links to any
39 successor documents.

40 Recommendation 2019-3 reserved the question, however, of which inoperative guidance
41 documents agencies should publish online. This Recommendation takes up that issue, building
42 on the principles Recommendation 2019-3 set forth for operative documents by extending them,
43 as appropriate, to inoperative guidance documents. Specifically, it advises agencies to develop
44 written procedures for publishing inoperative guidance documents, devise effective strategies for
45 labeling and organizing these documents on their websites, and deploy other means of
46 disseminating information about these documents.¹⁰ The Recommendation also encourages
47 agencies to provide clear cross-references or links between inoperative guidance documents and
48 any operative guidance documents replacing or modifying them.

49 This Recommendation, like Recommendation 2019-3, accounts for differences across
50 agencies in terms of the number of guidance documents they issue, how they use guidance

⁹ See OFFICE OF MGMT. & BUDGET, EXEC. OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT, OMB BULL. NO. 07-02, FINAL BULLETIN FOR AGENCY GOOD GUIDANCE PRACTICES (2007).

¹⁰ Several paragraphs of this Recommendation directly or indirectly apply the paragraphs of Recommendation 2019-3 to inoperative guidance documents. Compare Paragraph 1 of this Recommendation with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶ 1; Paragraph 3 with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶¶ 4, 7, 9; Paragraph 4 with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶ 8; and Paragraph 6 with Recommendation 2019-3, ¶ 11.



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

51 documents, and their resources and capacities for managing online access to these documents.¹¹
52 Accordingly, although it is likely that agencies following this Recommendation will make some
53 of their inoperative guidance documents more readily available to the public, this
54 Recommendation should not be understood as necessarily advising agencies to post the full
55 universe of their inoperative guidance documents online.

56 This Recommendation is limited to guidance documents that become inoperative in the
57 future. Agencies may, of course, choose to apply it retro~~spectively~~**actively** to existing inoperative
58 guidance documents.

RECOMMENDATION

Establishing Written Procedures Governing the Public Availability of Inoperative Guidance Documents **Prospectively**

- 59 1. Each agency should develop and publish on its website written procedures governing the
60 public availability of inoperative guidance documents and should consider doing the
61 following in its procedures:
- 62 a. Explaining what it considers to be inoperative guidance documents for purposes
63 of its procedures instituted under this Recommendation;
 - 64 b. Identifying which one or more of the following kinds of inoperative guidance
65 documents are covered by its procedures: rescinded guidance documents, partially
66 rescinded guidance documents, superseded guidance documents, partially
67 superseded guidance documents, or guidance documents that have fallen into
68 disuse in whole or in part;
 - 69 c. Identifying, within the kinds of inoperative guidance documents covered by its
70 procedures, which categories of inoperative guidance documents will be

Commented [CMA1]: Proposed Amendment from
Government Member Christina E. McDonald #1:

The preamble states, "This Recommendation is limited to guidance documents that become inoperative in the future," so clarifying language would be helpful in the actual recommendation that this is prospective (with the option of course to apply retrospectively). There is no strong preference on the placement of the word "prospectively," just somewhere within the title or Paragraph 1.

¹¹ See Todd Rubin, Public Availability of Inoperative Agency Guidance Documents (Nov. 22, 2021) (report to the Admin. Conf. of the U.S.); Cary Coglianese, Public Availability of Agency Guidance Documents (May 15, 2019) (report to the Admin. Conf. of the U.S.).



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

- 71 published on its website and otherwise made publicly available, taking into
72 consideration the categories articulated in Paragraph 2 below;
- 73 d. Explaining how it will include links or cross-references between any related
74 inoperative and operative guidance documents;
- 75 e. Specifying how long inoperative guidance documents will be retained on its
76 website;
- 77 f. Specifying whether some types of previously unpublished operative guidance
78 documents will be posted on its website and otherwise made publicly available
79 when they become inoperative and, if so, under what circumstances;
- 80 g. Providing for how inoperative guidance documents will be organized on its
81 website to facilitate searching and public access;
- 82 h. Identifying, as provided in Paragraph 4 below, what labels and explanations it will
83 use to communicate clearly the inoperative status of guidance documents; and
84 i. Indicating whether any **or all** of the procedures should be applied retroactively.

Determining Which Categories of Inoperative Guidance Documents to Publish Online and Otherwise Make Publicly Available

- 85 2. Each agency should consider publishing on its website and otherwise making publicly
86 available one or more of the following categories of inoperative guidance documents:
- 87 a. Inoperative guidance documents whose operative versions it made publicly
88 available **and whose continued availability is of interest or use to the public;**
- 89 b. Inoperative guidance documents that, if they were operative, would be made
90 publicly available under its current policies;
- 91 c. Inoperative guidance documents that have been replaced or amended by currently
92 operative guidance documents;
- 93 d. Inoperative guidance documents that expressed policies or legal interpretations
94 that remain relevant to understanding current law or policy;
- 95 e. Inoperative guidance documents that generated reliance interests when they were
96 operative;

Commented [CMA2]: Proposed Amendment from Government Member Christina E. McDonald #2:

Our concern is the overwhelming task of keeping older versions of all inoperative documents online, especially documents that would not be of interest or benefit to the public. There is a cost to maintaining these documents online, and a broad reading of this section would unfairly burden agencies with a large catalogue of inoperative documents that have little to no benefit to anyone. Moreover, having and maintaining a large repository of inoperative guidance documents could lead to confusion and reliance on outdated guidance. Therefore, leaving more room for each agency to decide would strengthen this recommendation.



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

- 97 f. Inoperative guidance documents that generate—or, when they were operative,
98 generated—numerous unique inquiries from the public;
- 99 g. Inoperative guidance documents that are—or, when operative, were—the subject
100 of attention in the general media or specialized publications relevant to the
101 agency, or have been cited frequently in other agency documents, such as permits,
102 licenses, grants, loans, contracts, or briefs;
- 103 h. Inoperative guidance documents **that, when originally being formulated, whose**
104 **operative versions** generated a high level of public participation **when they were**
105 **originally being formulated**; and
- 106 i. Inoperative guidance documents that, when operative or originally being
107 formulated, had been published in the *Unified Agenda of Federal Regulatory and*
108 *Deregulatory Actions* or were considered “significant guidance documents” under
109 the Office of Management and Budget’s *Final Bulletin for Agency Good*
110 *Guidance Practices*.

Organizing and Labeling Inoperative Guidance Documents Available Online

- 111 3. Each agency should organize its inoperative guidance documents on its website to make
112 it easy for members of the public to find them and relate them to any successor guidance
113 documents. The agency should consider one or more of the following approaches:
- 114 a. Assigning a unique guidance identification number to each inoperative guidance
115 document, if this number had not already been assigned when the document was
116 operative;
- 117 b. Creating a table that is indexed, tagged, or sortable and is dedicated exclusively to
118 displaying entries for inoperative guidance documents, with links to these
119 documents;
- 120 c. Providing a search function that enables retrieval of inoperative guidance
121 documents;
- 122 d. Using a method, such as a pull-down menu, that allows the public to view
123 inoperative guidance documents and see that they are inoperative; and



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

- 124 e. Including links or notations within inoperative guidance documents, pointing to
125 any successor operative guidance documents.
- 126 4. Each agency should label inoperative guidance documents on its website to ensure that
127 the public can readily understand the inoperative status of those guidance documents. The
128 agency should consider adopting one or more of the following methods for publicly
129 labeling its guidance documents as inoperative and then using the selected method or
130 methods consistently:
- 131 a. Including a watermark that displays “rescinded,” “partially rescinded,”
132 “superseded,” “partially superseded,” “not in use,” or similar terminology as
133 appropriate across each page of an inoperative guidance document;
- 134 b. Including words such as “rescinded,” “partially rescinded,” “superseded,”
135 “partially superseded,” “not in use,” or similar terminology as appropriate within
136 a table in which links to inoperative guidance documents appear;
- 137 c. Using an appropriate method, including redline versions or lists of changes, to
138 communicate changes made to a guidance document that has been partially
139 rescinded or superseded;
- 140 d. Including a prominent stamp at the top of an inoperative guidance document
141 noting that the document is inoperative and indicating the date it became
142 inoperative;
- 143 e. Providing cross-references, using links or notations, from an inoperative guidance
144 document to any successor versions of the guidance document, and vice versa;
145 and
- 146 f. Publishing a notice of rescission or partial rescission of a guidance document on
147 the agency’s website and providing links to this notice in the inoperative guidance
148 document.



ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

Using Means in Addition to Agency Websites to Notify the Public When a Guidance Document Has Become Inoperative

- 149 5. At a minimum, an agency should notify the public that a guidance document has become
150 inoperative in the same way that it notified the public that the operative version of the
151 guidance document was issued or in the same way it would notify the public that an
152 operative version of the guidance document has been issued under the agency's current
153 policies.
- 154 6. An agency should consider using one or more of the following methods to notify the
155 public when a guidance document has become inoperative:
- 156 a. Publishing this notification in the *Federal Register* even when not required to do
157 so by law;
 - 158 b. Sending this notification over an agency listserv or to a similar mailing list to
159 which the public can subscribe;
 - 160 c. Providing this notification during virtual meetings, in-person meetings, or
161 webinars involving the public; and
 - 162 d. Publishing this notification in a press release.
- 163 7. In disseminating notifications as indicated in Paragraph 6, agencies should consider
164 including cross-references to any successor guidance documents.